



GRETCHEN WHITMER  
GOVERNOR

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
DEPARTMENT OF LICENSING AND REGULATORY AFFAIRS  
LANSING

ORLENE HAWKS  
DIRECTOR

## **MICHIGAN BOARD OF REAL ESTATE BROKERS AND SALESPERSONS**

**JUNE 5, 2023 MEETING**

### **APPROVED MINUTES**

In accordance with the Open Meetings Act, 1976 PA 267, as amended, the Michigan Board of Real Estate Brokers and Salespersons met on June 5, 2023, at 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper-Level Conference Room 4, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

#### **CALL TO ORDER**

Natalie Rowe, Real Estate Associate Broker, Chairperson, called the meeting to order at 10:01 a.m.

#### **ROLL CALL**

**Members Present:** Natalie Rowe, Real Estate Associate Broker, Chairperson  
Benjamin Smith, III, Real Estate Broker, Vice Chairperson  
(arrived 10:05 a.m.)  
Chase Cantrell, Public Member  
Christopher Germain, Real Estate Salesperson  
Andrew Gutman, Real Estate Associate Broker  
Abe Koumaiha, Real Estate Agent  
Maggie LaHaie, Public Member  
Nusrat Moghul, Real Estate Broker (arrived 10:08 a.m.)

**Members Absent:** Christian Rodriguez, Public Member

**Staff:** Laury Brown, Senior Analyst, Compliance Section  
Sloane Ebersole, Senior Analyst, Compliance Section  
Dena Marks, Departmental Specialist, Boards and Committees Section  
Stephanie Wysack, Board Support Technician,  
Boards and Committees Section

## **APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by Gutman, to approve the agenda, as presented.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

## **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

MOTION by LaHaie, seconded by Cantrell, to approve the minutes from February 13, 2023, as written.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

## **REGULATORY CONSIDERATIONS**

### **Petition for Reinstatement**

#### **Lee Scott**

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by Germain, to deny the Petition for Reinstatement.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Smith,  
Rowe  
Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

### **Hearing Reports**

MOTION by LaHaie, seconded by Cantrell, to receive the hearing reports.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

#### **Dan Wicker**

MOTION by Smith, seconded by Cantrell, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

**MOTION PREVAILED**

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by Germain, to revoke the Respondent's license for a minimum of three years. Respondent is fined \$10,000.00 to be paid prior to filing an application for reinstatement. Respondent shall pay \$38,650.00 in restitution to the buyer within 12 months.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul,  
Smith, Rowe  
Nays: None

**MOTION PREVAILED**

**Jane Q. Yang**

MOTION by Smith, seconded by Cantrell, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

**MOTION PREVAILED**

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by Gutman, to place the Respondent on probation for a minimum of one day, not to exceed 180 days, to complete 24 hours of continuing education in areas accepted by the board, which will not count towards current renewal requirements. Respondent is fined \$1,050.00 to be paid within 90 days. If Respondent fails to comply, the license shall be suspended for a minimum of one day until compliant.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul,  
Rowe  
Nays: None  
Abstain: Smith

**MOTION PREVAILED**

### **Consent Orders and Stipulations**

Smith served as chairperson for items 5.C.1.

#### **Matthew Christopher O'Laughlin**

Rowe and Moghul recused themselves.

MOTION by LaHaie, seconded by Germain, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Smith  
Nays: None  
Recuse: Moghul, Rowe

MOTION PREVAILED

Rowe resumed serving as chairperson.

#### **Dominick Comer & Associates, Incorporated and Kevin Rey Schingeck**

MOTION by Moghul, seconded by Smith, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Koumaiha, seconded by Smith, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul,  
Smith, Rowe  
Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

Smith served as chairperson for item 5.C.3.

#### **Kimberli Michelle Ford**

Rowe recused herself.

MOTION by LaHaie, seconded by Cantrell, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul,  
Smith  
Nays: None  
Recuse: Rowe

MOTION PREVAILED

Rowe resumed serving as chairperson.

**Michael David Kemsley**

MOTION by Koumaiha, seconded by LaHaie, to discuss.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Discussion was held.

MOTION by Smith, seconded by Koumaiha, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul,  
Smith, Rowe  
Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

**Kenneth S. Maly**

MOTION by Cantrell, seconded by Gutman, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

Discussion was held.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Germain, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul,  
Smith, Rowe  
Nays: None

MOTION PREVAILED

**Linda J. Simpson**

Germain recused himself.

MOTION by Gutman, seconded by Koumaiha, to accept the Consent Order and Stipulation.

A roll call vote was taken: Yeas: Cantrell, Gutman, Koumaiha, LaHaie, Moghul, Smith,  
Rowe  
Nays: None  
Recuse: Germain

MOTION PREVAILED

## **OLD BUSINESS**

None

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **Real Estate Brokers and Salespersons Resolutions Concerning Continuing Education Review**

Marks provided an overview of the proposed revised Board of Real Estate Brokers and Salesperson resolutions concerning continuing education, which includes a new provision about how to manage a continuing education waiver request when the board meeting scheduled to consider the request is canceled, through no fault of the licensee.

Discussion held regarding the department consulting with the chairperson or designee.

Marks to provide updated Resolution Concerning Continuing Education at the next meeting on August 14, 2023.

### **Chair Report**

Rowe stated that there are allegations that she will be assigning to board members.

Rowe reminded board members to continue to check their state email.

### **Department Update**

Marks announced that the department will hold board member training on August 22, 2023, at 1:00 p.m. via Zoom. All members are welcome to attend.

Marks stated that Bryan Modelski had been named the new Deputy Director with the Bureau of Professional Licensing.

Marks stated that HB 4693 had been introduced, allowing for remote meeting attendance.

Marks stated that Sloane Ebersole will be the new compliance analyst for the board.

## **PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on August 14, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. at 611 West Ottawa Street, Upper-Level Conference Center Room 4, Lansing, Michigan 48933.

## **ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION by Smith, seconded by Cantrell, to adjourn the meeting at 11:21 a.m.

A voice vote followed.

MOTION PREVAILED

Minutes approved by the Board on: August 25, 2023.

Prepared by:  
Stephanie Wysack, Board Support Technician  
Bureau of Professional Licensing

June 5, 2023